Salud, Ciencia y Tecnología. 2025; 5:1950 doi: 10.56294/saludcyt20251950

ORIGINAL



Understanding and Implementation of Value Education through Physical Education

Comprensión e implementación de la educación en valores a través de la educación física

Eko Purnomo¹ ¹ □ ⋈, Amung Ma'mun² ¹ □, Mashuri Eko Winarno³ ¹ ⋈, Nina Jermaina⁴ ¹ ⋈

Cite as: Purnomo E, Ma'mun A, Eko Winarno M, Jermaina N. Understanding and Implementation of Value Education through Physical Education. Salud, Ciencia y Tecnología. 2025; 5:1950. https://doi.org/10.56294/saludcyt20251950

Submitted: 19-01-2025 Revised: 07-04-2025 Accepted: 29-07-2025 Published: 30-07-2025

Editor: Prof. Dr. William Castillo-González

Corresponding author: Eko Purnomo 🖂

ABSTRACT

This research is motivated by the decline of universal values influenced by the rapid growth of technology and weak social-family support, schools emerge as strategic institutions to foster the integrity of universal values. This study aims to explore the important role of universal values at all levels of education in the implementation through physical education in schools. This research method uses a qualitative approach with a case study to explain the relationship between teachers and the application of universal values in physical education. The number of informants in this study was 30 teachers with details of 10 elementary school teachers, 10 junior high school teachers and 10 senior high school teachers. The findings show that elementary, junior high school, and senior high school teachers implement value education with varying depths from instilling basic virtues to engaging in ethical reflection. Although teacher competence is good, challenges such as limited time, lack of parental support, diverse student backgrounds, and integration programs that have not been planned perfectly. The results of this study conclude that collaborative efforts between educators and families are essential to strengthen consistent value formation. In addition, integrating value education with environmental education can foster sustainable attitudes and responsible behavior. This study emphasizes that values education must be embedded in school culture, supported by planned programs, competent teachers and parental cooperation.

Keywords: Social Values; Quality Education; Values; Implementation; Physical Education.

RESUMEN

Esta investigación, motivada por el declive de los valores universales, influenciado por el rápido crecimiento tecnológico y el escaso apoyo sociofamiliar, motiva a las escuelas a emerger como instituciones estratégicas para fomentar la integridad de dichos valores. Este estudio busca explorar la importancia de los valores universales en todos los niveles educativos para su implementación a través de la educación física en las escuelas. Este método de investigación utiliza un enfoque cualitativo con un estudio de caso para explicar la relación entre el profesorado y la aplicación de valores universales en la educación física. El estudio contó con 30 docentes, de los cuales 10 eran de primaria, 10 de secundaria y 10 de bachillerato. Los hallazgos muestran que el profesorado de primaria, secundaria y bachillerato implementa la educación en valores con distintos niveles de profundidad, desde la inculcación de virtudes básicas hasta la reflexión ética. Si bien

¹Universitas Negeri Padang, Faculty of Sports Science, Padang. Indonesia.

²Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Faculty of Sports Education and Health, Bandung. Indonesia.

³Universitas Negeri Malang, Faculty of Sports Science, Malang. Indonesia.

⁴Universitas Negeri Padang, Faculty of Sports Science, Padang. Indonesia.

la competencia docente es buena, existen desafíos como la escasez de tiempo, la falta de apoyo parental, la diversidad de orígenes estudiantiles y la planificación deficiente de los programas de integración. Los resultados de este estudio concluyen que la colaboración entre educadores y familias es esencial para fortalecer la formación consistente de valores. Además, la integración de la educación en valores con la educación ambiental puede fomentar actitudes sostenibles y un comportamiento responsable. Este estudio enfatiza que la educación en valores debe estar incorporada a la cultura escolar, apoyada por programas planificados, maestros competentes y cooperación de los padres.

Palabras clave: Valores Sociales; Educación de Calidad; Valores; Implementación; Educación Física.

INTRODUCTION

Values education is a broad approach to encouraging moral and ethical growth in people and society as a whole. Its goal is to help people develop a deep understanding of the principles that guide their actions and choices. (1,2) It includes a wide range of teaching methods and philosophical ideas that aim to teach students to be responsible, caring, and aware of their surroundings (3). The main goal of values education is to give people the mental and emotional skills they need to deal with difficult moral problems, make smart decisions, and make their communities better places to live. (4) Values, often described as motivators, play a crucial role in shaping our lives, influencing everything we do, and understanding them can deepen self-awareness, which is a key element in leadership development. (5) This form of education transcends the mere transmission of information, instead focusing on the holistic development of character and the cultivation of a moral compass that guides individuals throughout their lives. Integrating values education into various educational settings requires a nuanced understanding of its theoretical foundations, practical implementation strategies, and the diverse cultural contexts in which it is applied.

Core Principles and Objectives of Values Education

At its core, values education seeks to bridge the gap between ideal societal norms and the realities of the world, addressing the increasing disconnect that often fuels social problems (6). This involves fostering an environment where individuals are encouraged to critically examine their own beliefs and actions in relation to broader ethical frameworks. Social values, reflecting a society's ideal ways of thinking and acting, should ideally align with the values demonstrated in the real world to foster social cohesion and harmony. (6) The development of moral values, including love, responsibility, and justice, is central to this educational endeavor, focusing on cultivating a rational understanding of morality. (7) By focusing on building character, teaching techniques, and relevant course materials, values education provides an avenue for discussing and implementing such morals. (8) Values education aims to cultivate essential values, as well as instilling critical thinking and ethical reasoning skills. (9) These skills enable individuals to analyze complex situations, evaluate different perspectives, and make informed decisions based on ethical considerations. (10) Furthermore, values education encourages the development of empathy and compassion, fostering a sense of interconnectedness and social responsibility. (11) This involves promoting understanding and respect for diverse cultures, beliefs, and perspectives, thereby fostering inclusivity and tolerance.

The implementation of values education necessitates a multifaceted approach that integrates diverse pedagogical strategies and considers the unique needs and contexts of learners. Effective implementation involves creating a supportive and inclusive learning environment where individuals feel safe to explore their values, express their opinions, and engage in open dialogue. (6) Active learning methodologies, such as group discussions, role-playing, and case studies, can be employed to promote critical thinking, problem-solving, and ethical reasoning skills. Storytelling, debates, and community service projects are other effective methods for engaging learners and fostering a sense of social responsibility. The creation of a positive value atmosphere in schools is critical, as it allows students to observe firsthand the importance of honesty and respect. Teachers play a crucial role in modeling ethical behavior, providing guidance and support, and facilitating meaningful discussions on ethical dilemmas. (12) Values education can be integrated into the English as a second or foreign language classroom, with teachers taking a proactive role in the value development of their students. (13) Teachers require assistance from parents, school stakeholders and the media to instill values in students. (14) Additionally, technology can be leveraged to enhance values education through interactive simulations, online resources, and virtual communities that promote collaboration and knowledge sharing.

Schools need to move past solely providing academic curriculums and start focusing on building school cultures that empower both students and teachers to navigate the various values and social norms of their communities. (15) Schools need to be committed to creating an environment that is a values-based learning environment that emphasizes caring relationships, collaborative decision making, and social responsibility.

The deep structures and slow-growing processes which can cultivate a sense of values in a human community are related to how some schools have successfully achieved a values community, in which all are valued and can make a contribution. This also includes helping students develop an understanding of how to address sensitive values issues in public and make sound decisions. In this way, values issues can be integrated into all levels of schooling and across all disciplines and subjects.

Values education is something that must be given to students in schools, from elementary schools to tertiary institutions. (18) Values education is very influential in shaping the character of students to be better and more developed. The main aim of education is to shape the values of students. (19) Students who have good values will certainly be more useful for their nation and country. (20) Values teachings refer to the good deeds of humans as servants of God and humans as social beings who need each other. (21) Values is a cultural phenomenon and a human creation, differentiating humans from animals by regulating social life and emphasizing self-introspection. Values is the basic attribute of being human, intrinsic to human nature. (22) Values education is not just teaching about good and bad. However, it is how Values values can be internalized and implemented in everyday life. Values education is essential for students, especially in conventional phases where they seek recognition and validation from their peers. (19)

Research Questions

- 1. How do elementary, junior high, and high school teachers understand values education?
- 2. How is the implementation of values education carried out by teachers at each level?
- 3. What are the challenges faced by teachers in understanding and implementing values education?

Research Objectives

- To uncover the understanding of values education among elementary, middle, and high school teachers.
- 2. To analyze the forms and strategies used by teachers at each level of education to implement values education.
- 3. To identify the challenges teachers, face in understanding and implementing values education in schools.

METHOD

Design

In this study, a conceptually related case study approach is used, for example, to describe in detail how teachers' understanding and implementation of value education. Case studies are characterized by their extreme concentration on specific phenomena in real-life settings. (23) This type of research is when there are factors that are much more relevant than data points. (23) A case study is an empirical research study designed to examine a current phenomenon in depth and in an actual setting, especially when the line separating the phenomenon from its environment is not clear. (23)

Key Informant Determination Technique

The key informant technique is a qualitative research method that has been widely and successfully used in several branches of the social sciences and can provide useful contributions to various studies. (24) Its main advantages relate to the quality of data that can be collected in a limited time frame and the approach has the potential to be useful as a stand-alone research technique or in conjunction with other qualitative methods. Characteristics of an ideal key informant: (24)

- 1. Knowledge: In addition to having access to the desired information, the informant must absorb the information in a meaningful way.
- 2. Willingness: The informant must be willing to communicate his/her knowledge to the interviewer and cooperate as much as possible.
- 3. Communication skills: The informant must be able to communicate his/her knowledge in a way that the interviewer can understand.
- 4. Impartiality: The key informant must be objective and impartial. Any relevant bias must be known to the interviewer.

Based on the explanation of the key informant criteria requirements above, the key informant criteria determined by the researcher are:

- 1. Willing to be interviewed and able to explain the values in physical education
- 2. Know and understand the values in physical education well
- 3. Physical education teachers who are active and integrate values in physical education

Informants

Based on the research objectives that have been determined in this study, to answer the formulation of the problems that have been determined, the author determines the criteria for selecting the most appropriate informants to obtain the information needed accurately, completely, and comprehensively. The criteria for selecting informants in this study are organizational administrators, government, academics, and also the community who are taken using purposive sampling techniques.

Data collection in this study were physical education teachers from elementary, middle to high school levels. The total informants in this study were 30 physical education teachers (10 elementary, 10 middle and 10 high schools) spread across several cities in West Sumatra Province, Indonesia. All of these respondents were physical education teachers who taught in the province of West Sumatra, with teaching experience ranging from 5-30 years.

The informants in this study will provide an in-depth look at the understanding, practices, and challenges of physical education teachers in integrating values education at the elementary, middle, and high school levels. Data collection was conducted through semi-structured interviews, field observations, and document analysis with 30 selected teachers who demonstrated the application of universal values in their learning.

The data collection process was conducted in stages, through recording interview narratives and direct field observations, with the aim of capturing the authentic and reflective experiences of the informants. All interview data was recorded, transcribed verbatim, and then stored digitally in an organized system managed using Atlas.ti software.

The information processing process involved open coding, categorization, and the extraction of key themes relevant to the research focus. This approach yielded systematic findings regarding (1) teachers' understanding of values education, (2) the implementation of values education in physical education learning, and (3) the challenges faced in understanding and implementing values education at each level of education.

Table 1. Research Informant Information												
No	Gender (M/F)	Educ.	TE	No	Gender (M/F)	Educ.	TE	No	Gender (M/F)	Educ.	TE	
Elementary School Teacher				Junio	Junior High School Teacher				Senior High School Teacher			
SD1	F	В	20	SMP1	М	В	3	SMA1	М	М	7	
SD2	F	В	13	SMP2	М	В	6	SMA2	М	М	8	
SD3	М	В	2	SMP3	М	В	4	SMA3	М	М	19	
SD4	F	В	15	SMP4	М	В	5	SMA4	М	В	33	
SD5	F	В	15	SMP5	М	В	6	SMA5	F	М	10	
SD6	F	В	8	SMP6	М	В	5	SMA6	М	В	26	
SD7	М	В	12	SMP7	М	В	8	SMA7	M	М	3	
SD8	F	В	12	SMP8	F	В	20	SMA8	М	В	3	
SD9	М	В	13	SMP9	М	В	2	SMA9	М	М	11	
SD10	F	В	8	SMP10	М	В	20	SMA10	М	В	4	

Note: Educ.: Teacher's final education TE: Teaching Experience (in years)

B: Bachelor; M: Master. M: Male; F: Female.

Data Triangulation

Triangulation is the combination of two or more data sources, researchers, methodological approaches, theoretical perspectives or analysis methods in the same study. (25) This combination produces data triangulation, researcher triangulation, methodological triangulation, theoretical triangulation, or analytical triangulation. (25) When more than one type of triangulation is used, for example, two or more data sources together with two or more researchers, the resulting complex triangulation is referred to as multiple triangulation. (25) One of the main goals of triangulation validation is to reduce, eliminate, or compensate for the shortcomings of one strategy, thereby increasing the ability to interpret the findings. Johnson's list of strategies includes data triangulation (the use of multiple data sources to help understand a phenomenon); method triangulation (the use of multiple research methods to study a phenomenon); researcher triangulation (the use of multiple researchers to collect and interpret data); and theory triangulation (the use of multiple theories and perspectives to help interpret and explain data). (26)

RESULTS

The results of this study reveal in-depth the understanding, practices, and challenges of physical education

teachers in integrating values education at the elementary, middle, and high school levels. The findings were obtained through interviews, observations, and document analysis of 30 selected teachers who have implemented universal values in their learning. The results of the study are presented based on three data collection processes, namely: (1) Interviews, (2) Observations, and (3) Document Analysis. The results of the study can be seen in the following description:

Interview

The researcher digs deeper into how physical education teachers implement universal values in schools through physical education. After conducting in-depth questions, the researcher then conducts an analysis using Atlas. Ti software. The software will analyze three main indicators given to physical education teachers, namely: a) teachers' understanding of values education across educational levels; b) characteristics of values education implementation at different educational levels; c) challenges and collaborative solutions in values education.

Table 2. Number of Words that Appear in Interview Sessions Related to Teacher Understanding									
Teacher Understanding	ES	JHS	SHS						
Rules	2	9	13						
Student Discipline	5	1	43						
Discussion	3	5	6						
Support	13	14	10						
Empathy	4	7	1						
Interaction	6	12	9						
Grade Level	4	5	11						
Character	6	14	3						
Fairness	3	9	5						
Success	4	3	4						
Honesty	26	14	14						
Caring	2	8	1						
Self-Confidence	5	3	6						
Cooperation	26	42	43						
Collaboration	3	0	10						
Communication	18	9	24						
Values	33	30	32						
Understanding	18	3	12						
Learning	8	7	8						
Close Approach	0	3	9						
Value Education	31	33	55						
Value Application	2	9	6						
Respect	4	4	14						
Student Attention	8	2	1						
Hands-on Practice	4	8	1						
Respect	8	27	15						
Sportsmanship	24	44	38						
Responsibility	11	23	27						
Note: ES: Elementary School									

Note: ES: Elementary School JHS: Junior High School SHS: Senior High School

Question 1: How do elementary, junior high, and high school teachers understand values education?

Elementary, middle, and high school teachers' understanding of value education shows significant variation, depending on the level of education and teaching context. At the elementary and middle school levels they explained that:

"Teachers tend to focus more on introducing basic values such as honesty, discipline, and cooperation.

However, there are challenges in implementing these values practically, especially because of the limited experience of students at this level. For example, students in elementary and middle school may not dare to try more complex activities, so teachers must provide supportive learning experiences".

Meanwhile, the high school teacher informant explained:

"At the high school level, the understanding of value education is more in-depth, with an emphasis on the application of values in the context of everyday life. Teachers at this level strive to shape students' character through practical experience and reflection, and encourage students to value sportsmanship and cooperation in sports activities".

Still related to the first question, with the exploration of other questions related to how the role of teachers in providing value teaching?

"Teachers at all levels of education are role models for students. They must demonstrate behavior that reflects the values taught, such as sportsmanship and cooperation. For example, in sports, teachers must teach students to respect opponents and accept defeat with an open heart. While at the high school level, teachers use more discussion and reflection methods to help students understand and apply these values. They also try to involve parents in the educational process to reinforce the values taught in school".

And the last question is how does value education impact students' daily lives?

"Value education is expected to bring positive changes in students' attitudes, such as increasing respect, cooperation, and discipline. Students involved in value education show improvements in their ability to interact with friends and teachers, as well as in respecting existing rules and norms".

Based on the results of the interview session, at least we found several words that were often said by physical education teachers related to physical education teachers' understanding of universal values.

Overall, teachers' understanding of values education varies by education level, with teachers at the high school level having a more complex and in-depth approach. All teachers, however, have an important role in shaping students' character through teaching values that are relevant to their lives.

Question 2: How is the implementation of values education carried out by teachers at each level?

The implementation of values education by teachers at each level (elementary, junior high, and senior high) is carried out with different approaches, according to the characteristics of the students and the learning context. Approaches taken:

"At the elementary school level, teachers focus more on introducing basic values such as honesty, discipline, and cooperation. They use games and physical activities to teach these values in a practical way. Teachers act as role models by demonstrating good behavior, such as respecting friends and accepting defeat with an open heart. At the junior high school level, teachers begin to integrate values in the context of sports. They teach the value of sportsmanship and the importance of respecting opponents in games. Teachers encourage parental involvement in supporting values education at home, so that the values taught at school can be reinforced in the family environment. At the senior high school level, teachers have a more in-depth and complex approach. They not only teach values, but also encourage students to apply them in everyday life and in broader contexts. Teachers serve as guides who help students overcome challenges in applying values, as well as provide emotional support and motivation".

"The implementation of value education by teachers at each level of education has different characteristics, with an emphasis on the introduction of values in elementary school, application in the context of sports in junior high school, and analysis and reflection in high school. All teachers play an important role in shaping students' character through teaching values that are relevant to their lives".

Question 3: What are the challenges faced by teachers in understanding and implementing values education? The challenges faced by teachers in understanding and implementing values education at various levels of education (elementary, junior high, and senior high school) include several important aspects. The following is a summary of these challenges:

"a) student Attitudes and Motivation: many students are less motivated to apply the values taught, especially if they are more focused on competition and winning in sports activities; b) student Character: some students have poor character, which may be caused by a lack of support from the home environment. This makes it difficult for teachers to instill positive values; c) limited Time and Resources: the time available to teach values in physical education is often not enough to discuss them in depth. Many schools do not have adequate sports equipment, so teachers must modify games or activities to still be able to teach these values; d) differences in Student Backgrounds: students come from various backgrounds that affect their understanding and application of values. These differences can create difficulties in creating understanding among students; e) a home environment that does not support values education can be a major challenge for teachers. Students who do not receive support at home may struggle to apply the values taught in school. Parental support is essential, but often lacking. Teachers feel the need to involve parents more actively in supporting values education at home".

Observation

Observations of physical education learning practices revealed various concrete forms of universal values implementation by teachers at three levels of education. Throughout the learning process, researchers noted interaction patterns, pedagogical approaches, and social situations that reflected the integration of values such as responsibility, cooperation, honesty, and respect. These observational findings corroborated the interview results and provided a direct view of how these values were internalized in physical education activities on the school field. Based on observations, researchers obtained several main points, and became one of the important findings to be followed up. Among others: a) The implementation of universal values has indeed been carried out by physical education teachers during learning, it's just that the implementation has not run smoothly and there have been a few problems, especially class management that has not been well coordinated. This is because the implementation that has been carried out has not been fully programmed properly; b) Based on observations, it was found that students are still not familiar with universal values education through physical education, many students still do not get a sense of these universal values (especially learning carried out at the elementary school level). While learning at the high school level, researchers found student responses who were very quick to understand what was targeted in the learning. c) Although the learning of universal values has not been maximized, there has been a change in students' attitudes which has become better than before.

Document Analysis

The documents analyzed included lesson plans (RPP), syllabi, daily journals, and teacher evaluation tools. These documents identified that some teachers explicitly included values such as sportsmanship, responsibility, and cooperation in both learning objectives and core activities. This finding reinforces the indication that values education is not only present in practice but is also beginning to be systematically designed into lesson planning. Based on the documents that researchers have, available syllabus documents and learning implementation plans, there is no program that is intentionally applied to universal values. Teachers still make many learning objectives based on physical and motor skills. Although there are components of attitudes such as cooperation, honesty, respect, enthusiasm and sportsmanship, it is still unclear regarding their implementation. So that the results of the implementation of universal values cannot be said to be completely successful. There needs to be a program that is truly written and deliberately arranged to get maximum results and have an impact on students.

DISCUSSION

Moral decline among adolescents can occur due to a failure in the socialization process within the family environment and the social environments in which they interact. (19) Adolescents involved in peer groups are at risk of engaging in actions that conflict with moral values, such as fighting, cheating, bullying, and vandalism, due to the influence of their peers. (19) In this context, interactions with peers have a significant impact on students' moral behavior. (19) When students spend more time with their peers, this influence unconsciously shapes their attitudes, actions, and behavior. (19) Therefore, moral and character education is an important part of the educational process so that individuals grow with strong personalities and moral integrity. (27) However, in reality, the role of ethics education in regulating behavior is now weakened because it is only integrated into civics lessons, not as a stand-alone subject. (28)

Advances in information technology also present their own challenges. While widespread access to information can be utilized positively, without adequate value guidance, it can accelerate the shift in moral values among adolescents. (29) This shift occurs along with a diminishing understanding of the values of virtue, honesty, responsibility, and social concern. (30) Therefore, the role of schools is very strategic in shaping students' values, as schools are not only places for transferring knowledge but also arenas for character formation through interactions, institutional structures, and the implemented curriculum. (30) Research shows that students' current moral condition is moderate, while teacher competence tends to be good, but has not been fully maximized in moral development. (19,31,32,33,34)

These research findings reinforce the importance of values education in addressing the challenge of moral degradation, particularly through physical education instruction. Physical education teachers at the elementary, middle, and high school levels have demonstrated a commitment to instilling universal values such as sportsmanship, cooperation, responsibility, and respect through contextual physical activities. However, it was found that teachers' understanding of values education is highly dependent on their teaching level and experience. At the elementary level, values instillation is more introductory through direct methods and role models. Meanwhile, in middle school, teachers are beginning to encourage the application of values in social interactions and sports activities, and at the high school level, the approach has already touched on ethical analysis and reflection on real-life moral issues faced by students.

This aligns with the view that values education must be developed from an early age through habituation, integration into learning, and a conducive school environment. Teachers play a significant role as role models,

guides, and facilitators in shaping students' character. (31) Therefore, values education cannot be separated from the primary function of schools in producing a generation that is not only academically intelligent but also ethically and spiritually strong.

Values education is crucial in shaping prosocial behavior, especially given the increasing tendency toward aggression among adolescents. (12) Not only students but also school leaders are vulnerable to moral deviations if they lack a strong foundation of values, which can ultimately have a negative impact on the educational climate and the wider community. Therefore, schools play a crucial role in preventing moral crises and developing a generation with social sensitivity, ethics, and civic responsibility. (33,35)

This study also found that the success of values education is strongly influenced by external factors, such as parental support and a home environment that aligns with the values instilled in schools. Teachers reported that family involvement in strengthening values education remains minimal, leading to inconsistencies in students' values implementation outside of school. This reinforces the notion that character education cannot be solely the responsibility of schools but must holistically involve families, communities, and religious institutions. (36,37,38,39)

Teachers' Understanding of Values Education Across Educational Levels

This study found that physical education teachers' understanding of values education differed at each educational level. At the elementary school level, teachers understood values education as an effort to instill basic moral values such as honesty, discipline, and respect through simple approaches such as providing advice, role modeling, and praising good behavior. (40) This aligns with the developmental needs of elementary school-aged children, who still think concretely and require an environment that supports positive character development. (41,42) This approach is consistent with literature that emphasizes the importance of a learning environment that supports early value formation. (43)

At the junior high school level, teachers' understanding deepened, with efforts to link values education to students' personal experiences and social issues. Teachers used group discussions, case studies, and debates to foster critical thinking about moral dilemmas students face daily. (44) The values taught were not only instilled but also reflectively cultivated through social interactions and collaborative physical education activities. Teachers also recognized the need to involve parents to consistently reinforce values at home. (44)

Meanwhile, high school teachers had a more complex and systematic understanding of values education. They see it as a foundation for helping students build a personal ethical framework to face the moral challenges of adulthood. (37,43) The approach used includes philosophical discussions, ethical analysis, and involvement in community service projects, so that values are not only taught but also experienced critically and practically. (37,45) This aligns with the view that character education must encompass dimensions of social responsibility, ethical decision-making, and moral courage. (44)

In its implementation, values learning is carried out in stages according to the characteristics of the students. Elementary school teachers emphasize introducing values through simple physical games; junior high school teachers begin integrating values in the context of sports and social relationships; while high school teachers emphasize internalizing values through reflection and real-life application in students' lives. However, this study also found that the implementation of values education is not yet fully systematic and still relies heavily on individual teacher initiative, not explicitly programmed in lesson planning documents (RPP and syllabus).

Challenges faced by teachers include low student motivation, unsupportive family backgrounds, limited time, and a lack of specific training for integrating values into physical education. Differences in student character and ability also hinder the alignment of understanding and application of values. These findings reinforce the importance of collaboration between teachers, students, and parents to create sustainable values reinforcement across various contexts of students' lives. (44)

Thus, values education in physical education lessons can be an important strategy in shaping a generation with character, if supported by strong teacher understanding, structured lesson planning, and ongoing involvement of the family and school environment.

Characteristics of Values Education Implementation at Different Educational Levels

Research results show that the implementation of values education by physical education teachers has different characteristics at each level of education, tailored to students' levels of cognitive, social, and emotional development.

At the elementary school level, teachers tend to focus on introducing basic values such as honesty, cooperation, and discipline. These values are instilled through direct and concrete methods, such as games, stories, songs, and through role models in the teacher's daily behavior. (42,46,47) Teachers act as consistent role models, creating a positive and safe learning environment where students feel valued and cared for. In addition to classroom learning, values are also integrated into extracurricular activities, social interactions, and students' daily routines, supporting holistic character development. (48)

At the junior high school level, the implementation of values education begins to focus on applying values

in a broader social context. Physical education teachers link values to real-world situations, such as teamwork, sportsmanship in competitions, and ethical decision-making in interactions between students. Values are also integrated into various subjects, such as social studies, history, and language, to foster students' awareness of their role in society. (49) At this level, students are encouraged to think critically and take responsibility for their actions within their groups and at school.

Meanwhile, at the high school level, values implementation takes a more reflective and analytical approach. Teachers facilitate ethical discussions, case analyses, and community service activities to instill the values of justice, social responsibility, and concern for global issues. (50) The learning process is geared toward enabling students to critically assess situations and make decisions based on moral considerations. In this regard, values are taught not only as social norms, but as life principles that must be practiced in real life.

In addition to the learning approach, schools also create a culture of values through traditions, written codes of ethics, and an inclusive environment that respects differences. (51,52) Teachers play a key role as ethical leaders, creating a shared vision and instilling the values of justice and integrity through concrete actions. Parental involvement is also becoming an integral part of reinforcing the values taught in schools, so that students continue to receive similar role models at home. (49,53) Schools that successfully cultivate an ethical culture make a significant contribution to preparing students to become responsible and just citizens. (54,55)

Thus, the implementation of values education in physical education has complementary pedagogical, social, and structural dimensions. The differing characteristics of each educational level indicate that strategies for instilling values must be contextual and tailored to the developmental needs of students at each stage.

Challenges and Collaborative Solutions in Values Education

This study found that physical education teachers face various challenges in understanding and effectively implementing values education in schools. One major challenge is the negative attitudes of some students toward values education, influenced by family background, social environment, and previous experiences. Many students focus more on the competitive aspects of sports and are less responsive to values such as sportsmanship, cooperation, and responsibility. This aligns with previous findings that differences in students' values and life experiences can hinder the effectiveness of universal values education. (53,54)

Time and resource constraints are also serious obstacles, especially when values education must be integrated into an already dense curriculum. Teachers often lack sufficient time to discuss values in depth in physical education lessons and also face limitations in facilities, tools, and relevant learning modules. ⁽⁵⁵⁾ Furthermore, the lack of professional training and substantial expertise in teaching values poses a barrier, making implementation intuitive and non-standardized.

Lack of parental support is also a significant challenge. Many teachers reported that the values taught in school are not always reinforced at home and may even conflict with parenting styles or norms prevailing in the students' families. This reinforces findings in the literature that parental involvement is crucial for building sustainable values education outside of school. (54,55)

Solutions emerging from field practice emphasize the importance of collaboration between teachers, students, and parents, as well as the creation of a safe and inclusive learning environment. Teachers need to build open and respectful communication with students, foster empathy and tolerance for diversity, and provide reflective spaces for students to explore the meaning of values contextually. Furthermore, schools need to actively involve parents through outreach, parent training, and joint activities that support consistent values reinforcement.

In the context of values education linked to environmental and sustainability issues, challenges also include reliance on traditional learning methods and minimal integration of environmental values into the curriculum, which creates a gap between learning content and students' real-life practices. ^(57,58) In low-income areas, inconsistent funding leads to low quality and sustainability of values and environmental education programs. ^(59,60) Therefore, the development of culturally relevant curricula and the enhancement of teacher capacity to address the challenges of a multicultural society are necessary. ⁽⁵⁶⁾

Thus, effective values education requires a collaborative approach involving all parties, supported by professional training, a contextual curriculum, and learning strategies that bridge universal values with students' real-life situations. These efforts are crucial for developing students with integrity, responsibility, and the readiness to become ethical global citizens. Overall, the results of this study indicate that the understanding, implementation, and challenges of values education through physical education vary significantly across educational levels. Elementary school teachers tend to prioritize a concrete and simple approach to introducing core values, while middle and high school teachers are beginning to develop more reflective and critical strategies. Although teachers demonstrate a strong commitment to instilling universal values such as honesty, cooperation, and responsibility, their implementation practices are not yet fully systematic and still face various structural and cultural barriers.

Challenges faced by teachers include a lack of time, resources, family support, and limited professional

training. Differences in student backgrounds and the mismatch between values taught in schools and those practiced at home also exacerbate the gap in the internalization of values. Nevertheless, these findings also suggest that collaboration between teachers, students, and parents, as well as the creation of a safe and supportive learning environment, can strengthen the effectiveness of values education.

Based on these findings, further research is recommended to develop innovative and effective methods for teaching values education, including the use of project-based approaches, real-life experiences, and reflective learning that actively engage students in social and community life. Future research should also evaluate the long-term impact of values education on student learning outcomes, including affective, social, and cognitive aspects.

Furthermore, further exploration is needed on the integration of environmental education into values education, particularly in the context of cross-disciplinary learning such as language and social studies. This is crucial for fostering environmental awareness and disaster preparedness from an early age. Future research should also examine how values and environmental education can be linked to community service programs, fieldwork, and community-based activities that have a real impact. Another strategic recommendation is to encourage social responsibility and values education to be integrated not only within specific subjects but also throughout the curriculum, through interdisciplinary, scientific, and cultural learning experiences.

Therefore, the future direction of values education development must be comprehensive, applicable, and contextual, to address the challenges of the times and shape a young generation with strong character, environmental awareness, and responsibility for the future of the global community.

CONCLUSIONS

This study revealed that physical education teachers' understanding of values education at the elementary, middle, and high school levels showed significant variation. Elementary and middle school teachers generally understood values education as an effort to introduce basic values such as honesty, discipline, and cooperation. Meanwhile, high school teachers had a more complex and reflective understanding, emphasizing the application of values in real life and encouraging students to reflect on their learning experiences. At all levels, teachers recognized their role as primary role models in instilling values, as well as the importance of parental involvement in supporting the values taught in school.

Teachers' implementation of values education also showed differences based on educational level. At the elementary school level, the approach was practical through simple games and physical activities. Teachers acted as positive behavioral models by demonstrating sportsmanship, respect for others, and responsibility. At the middle school level, values began to be integrated into the context of more structured sports games, with an emphasis on sportsmanship and respect for opponents. Meanwhile, at the high school level, teachers encouraged students to not only understand but also internalize values through discussion, reflection, and guidance in facing the challenges of applying values in real life. However, this implementation has not been fully systematically programmed and still relies on the initiative of individual teachers.

The main challenges teachers face in understanding and implementing values education include: low student motivation and initial character, limited time and resources, lack of family support, and uneven student backgrounds, which influence understanding of values. Teachers also experience limitations in terms of training and technical guidance for effectively integrating values into learning. Observations indicate that despite efforts to integrate values in the field, their implementation is not optimal, particularly at the elementary school level, indicating students' unpreparedness to understand the deeper meaning of values. Meanwhile, high school students demonstrate a more mature response in understanding and practicing the values taught.

Document analysis supports this finding, as most lesson plans and syllabi do not explicitly incorporate universal values. Values such as cooperation, sportsmanship, and honesty are listed in affective objectives, but have not been systematically integrated into learning strategies and evaluations. This suggests that although values have been implemented in practice, thorough planning and curriculum strengthening are still essential for optimal implementation of universal values in physical education learning and for long-term impacts on students.

Thus, values education in physical education lessons at school requires strengthening teachers' conceptual understanding, systematic lesson planning, contextual implementation strategies, and support from the school and family environment so that universal values can be effectively internalized by students.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat Universitas Negeri Padang for funding this work with a contract number: 1506/UN35.15/LT/2025

REFERENCES

1. Huang RX, Pagano A, Marengo A. Values-Based Education for Sustainable Development (VbESD): Introducing

- a Pedagogical Framework for Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) Using a Values-Based Education (VbE) Approach. Sustainability. 2024 Apr 24;16(9):3562. Available from: https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/16/9/3562
- 2. Nguyen QTN. The Vietnamese Values System: A Blend of Oriental, Western and Socialist Values. Int Educ Stud. 2016 Nov 28;9(12):32. Available from: http://www.ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/ies/article/view/59915
- 3. Lovat T, Clement N. Service Learning as Holistic Values Pedagogy. J Exp Educ. 2016 Jun 3;39(2):115-29. Available from: https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/1053825916628548
- 4. Chazan B. What Is "Moral Education"? In: Principles and Pedagogies in Jewish Education. Cham: Springer International Publishing; 2022. p. 23-34. Available from: https://link.springer.com/10.1007/978-3-030-83925-3_4
 - 5. Woodward IC, Shaffakat S. Understanding Values for Insightfully Aware Leadership. SSRN Electron J. 2014;
- 6. Türkkahraman M. Social Values and Value Education. Procedia Soc Behav Sci. 2014;116:633-8. Available from: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.01.270
- 7. Mao Y. Moral Values Education is the Core of Moral Education in Colleges and Universities. In: 2021 2nd Asia-Pacific Conference on Image Processing, Electronics and Computers. New York, NY, USA: ACM; 2021. p. 554-6. Available from: https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.1145/3452446.3452581
- 8. Emmons D, Nutt L. Values education and the criminal justice curriculum. J Crim Justice Educ. 1995 Mar;6(1):147-52. Available from: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10511259500083371
- 9. Dichter B-C. Fostering Social Values in Curricula in Israel and Around the World. Procedia Soc Behav Sci. 2015 Dec;209:116-21. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S187704281505613X
- 10. Scott RA. Global citizenship: Imagined destiny or improbable dream. UN Chron. 2018 Feb 27;54(4):12-4. Available from: https://www.un-ilibrary.org/content/journals/15643913/54/4/5
- 11. Mondal BC. Inculcating Human Values among School Students through Effective Teaching. J Soc Sci. 2017;13(2):102-7.
- 12. Jevtić B, Milanović NM. Teachers at Work Developing a Prosocial Personality. Eur J Educ Pedagog. 2021 Jun 25;2(3):73-9. Available from: https://www.ej-edu.org/index.php/ejedu/article/view/117
- 13. Shaaban K. A Proposed Framework for Incorporating Moral Education into the ESL/EFL Classroom. Lang Cult Curric. 2005 Sep 22;18(2):201-17. Available from: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/07908310508668742
- 14. Singh CKS, Singh TSM, Ong ET, Thambu N, Yusoff MZM, Moneyam S, et al. Pre-service Teachers' Perceptions of Lecturers' Teaching and Learning Strategies in Moral Education. Univers J Educ Res. 2020 Nov;8(11B):6307-12. Available from: http://www.hrpub.org/journals/article info.php?aid=10069
- 15. Gholami K, Tirri K. Caring Teaching as a Moral Practice: An Exploratory Study on Perceived Dimensions of Caring Teaching. Educ Res Int. 2012;2012:1-8. Available from: http://www.hindawi.com/journals/edri/2012/954274/
- 16. Tomlinson J. Values: the curriculum of moral education. Child Soc. 1997 Dec 10;11(4):242-51. Available from: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1099-0860.1997.tb00033.x
- 17. Miller SC, Bredemeier BJL, Shields DLL. Sociomoral Education Through Physical Education With At-Risk Children. Quest. 1997 Feb;49(1):114-29. Available from: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0033 6297.1997.10484227
 - 18. Waziana W, Saputra RH, Sinthiya IAPA. Implementation Of Moral Education In Schools To Face The

Development Of Science And Technology As A Fortress Of Demoralization. JLCEdu (Journal Learn Character Educ. 2021 Nov 29;1(2):59-68. Available from: https://journal.sracademicpublishing.org/index.php/JLCEdu/ article/view/18

- 19. Faulintya G, Nurmalisa Y, Mentari A. Pengaruh Interaksi Teman Sebaya Terhadap Tindakan Moral Pada Peserta Didik di SMP Negeri 1 Belitang. J Citizsh Media Publ Pendidik Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan. 2025 Jan 31;8(1):1-7. Available from: http://journal1.uad.ac.id/index.php/Citizenship/article/view/733
- 20. Yulia H. Morality: The Need of Today's Education. Edukasi Ling Sastra. 2018 May 15;16(1):47-57. Available from: https://jurnal.umko.ac.id/index.php/elsa/article/view/78
- 21. Aulia ER, P FR, Siregar B. The Role of Islamic Religious Education Teachers in Moral Development in MTs. Private Al-Azhar Medan Sunggal. Britain Int Linguist Arts Educ J. 2022 Oct 21;4(3):216-24. Available from: https://www.biarjournal.com/index.php/biolae/article/view/778
- 22. Tao Zhang, Problems of Moral Education in China's Schools and Solutions. Sociol Study, 2017 Jun 28;7(6). Available from: http://www.davidpublisher.org/index.php/Home/Article/index?id=34886.html
- 23. Yin RK. Case Study Research: Design and Methods. 4th ed. California: SAGE Publications; 2009. 219 p. Available from: https://books.google.co.id/books?id=k0WrN3rBz_sC
 - 24. Marshall MN. The key informant technique. Fam Pract. 1996;13(1):92-7.
 - 25. Thurmond VA. The point of triangulation. J Nurs Scholarsh. 2001;33(3):253-8.
- 26. Lauri MA. Triangulation of Data Analysis Techniques. Pap Soc Represent. 2011;20(34):1-15. Available from: https://psr.iscte-iul.pt/index.php/PSR/article/view/449/393
- 27. Kutlu A, Kutlu A. The Contribution of Moral Education on Raising Awareness of Citizenship Responsibility. Mediterr J Soc Sci. 2014 Aug 1; Available from: https://www.richtmann.org/journal/index.php/mjss/article/ view/4283
- 28. O'Hara SU, Biesecker A. Globalization: Homogenization or Newfound Diversity? Rev Soc Econ. 2003 Sep;61(3):281-94. Available from: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0034676032000115787
- 29. Puntaswari NC, Mukminan. Promoting Good Citizenship in the Social Studies Course at the Secondary School in Indonesia. In: Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Social Science and Character Educations (ICoSSCE 2019). Paris, France: Atlantis Press; 2020. Available from: https://www.atlantis-press. com/article/125933421
- 30. Biskin D, Hoskisson K. Moral Development Through Children's Literature. Elem Sch J. 1974 Dec; 75(3): 153-7. Available from: https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/460886
- 31. Aeni AN, Hanifah N, Sunaengsih C. The impact of the internet technology on teacher competence and student morality. J Phys Conf Ser. 2019 Oct 1;1318(1):012046. Available from: https://iopscience.iop.org/ article/10.1088/1742-6596/1318/1/012046
- 32. Muis A. The Nature of Educators and Students: The Study of Islamic Education Philosophy towards Character Establishment. Progres J Pemikir dan Pendidik Islam. 2021 Jun 22;10(1):12-23. Available from: https://ejournal.umm.ac.id/index.php/progresiva/article/view/17545
- 33. Susanto S, Ritonga AW, Desrani A. The Challenge of The Integrated Character Education Paradigm with 21st-Century Skills During The Covid-19 Pandemic. Cendekia J Kependidikan dan Kemasyarakatan. 2022 Jun 18;1(1):85-104. Available from: https://jurnal.iainponorogo.ac.id/index.php/cendekia/article/view/3816
- 34. Zamani DA, Al Bagi S. The Effectiveness of Islamic Guidance and Counseling to Reduce the Tendency of Juvenile Delinquency. At-Ta'dib. 2019 Jun 9;14(1):1. Available from: https://ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id/ index.php/tadib/article/view/3391

- 35. Phuc TQB, Nguyen LD, Parveen K, Wang M. Developing a theoretical model to examine factors affecting school leadership effectiveness. J Soc Sci Adv. 2020 Sep 28;1(01):16-29. Available from: http://www.scienceimpactpub.com/journals/index.php/jssa/article/view/71
- 36. Xie K. Character Education: From the Perspective of Confucian Ethics. Educ J. 2016;5(1):1. Available from: http://www.sciencepublishinggroup.com/journal/paperinfo?journalid=196&doi=10.11648/j.edu.20160501.11
- 37. Zarra EJ. Pinning down Character Education. Kappa Delta Pi Rec. 2000 Jul;36(4):154-7. Available from: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00228958.2000.10518776
- 38. Alvi ST, Khanam A, Kalsoom T. Document Analysis of Secondary School Curriculum Regarding Ethical and Moral Education in Punjab. Glob Reg Rev. 2020 Mar 30;V(I):191-206. Available from: https://grrjournal.com/article/document-analysis-of-secondary-school-curriculum-regarding-ethical-and-moral-education-in-punjab
- 39. Jena PC. Education as a Moral Enterprise for Adolescents. Int Lett Soc Humanist Sci. 2015 Sep;59:104-8. Available from: https://www.scipress.com/ILSHS.59.104
- 40. Erihadiana M. The Implementation of Islamic Local Content in Building Character Education at Junior High Shcool Al Amanah Bandung. J Pendidik Islam. 2019 Jan 25;4(2):41-50. Available from: https://journal.uinsgd.ac.id/index.php/jpi/article/view/3812
- 41. Shoshani A, Shwartz L. From Character Strengths to Children's Well-Being: Development and Validation of the Character Strengths Inventory for Elementary School Children. Front Psychol. 2018 Nov 2;9. Available from: https://www.frontiersin.org/article/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02123/full
- 42. Nada HN, Fajarningsih RU, Astirin OP. Environmental education to build school members' character. JPBI (Jurnal Pendidik Biol Indones. 2021 Mar 31;7(1):43-52. Available from: https://10.10.1.200/index.php/jpbi/article/view/14283
- 43. Humaerah PD, Mukminan, Sari JY. Teacher's Roles on the Implementation of Character Education in Elementary Schools. In: Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Social Science and Character Educations (ICoSSCE 2019). Paris, France: Atlantis Press; 2020. Available from: https://www.atlantis-press.com/article/125933440
- 44. Adhikari NP. Pedagogical Approaches for an Effective Classroom Management. Interdiscip Res Educ. 2021 Jun 30;6(1):45-56. Available from: https://www.nepjol.info/index.php/ire/article/view/43421
- 45. Sholiha S. Penanaman Nilai-nilai Karakter dalam Pembelajaran LPS di SMP Negeri 3 Jember. PROMOSI (Jurnal Pendidik Ekon. 2021 Jun 22;9(1). Available from: https://ojs.fkip.ummetro.ac.id/index.php/ekonomi/article/view/3840
- 46. Hibi W, Assadi N. What Is the Effect of Parents' Involvement on the Students' Educational Attainment in Mathematics and Their Value System at School from the Teachers' Perspective? Creat Educ. 2021;12(05):1118-39. Available from: https://www.scirp.org/journal/doi.aspx?doi=10.4236/ce.2021.125083
 - 47. Nwikina L. Fostering Ethical Behavior and Culture in Nigeria Schools. Int J Learn Dev. 2013;3(6):26.
- 48. Abdikarimova M, Tashieva N, Kyzy AT, Abdullaeva Z. Developing Students Verbal Communication Skills and Speech Etiquette in English Language Teaching. Open J Mod Linguist. 2021;11(01):83-9. Available from: https://www.scirp.org/journal/doi.aspx?doi=10.4236/ojml.2021.111007
- 49. Panesi S, Bocconi S, Ferlino L. Promoting Students' Well-Being and Inclusion in Schools Through Digital Technologies: Perceptions of Students, Teachers, and School Leaders in Italy Expressed Through SELFIE Piloting Activities. Front Psychol. 2020 Jul 30;11. Available from: https://www.frontiersin.org/article/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.01563/full
- 50. Vincent A, Meche M. Use of Ethical Dilemmas to Contribute to the Knowledge and Behavior of High School Students. High Sch J. 2001 Apr;84(4):50-7. Available from: https://muse.jhu.edu/article/13879

- 51. Stavropoulou A, Ooms A, Rovithis M, Stroumpouki T. Key concepts of ethical leadership: A review of the literature. World J Adv Res Rev. 2023 Mar 30;21(3):2227-32. Available from: https://wjarr.com/content/keyconcepts-ethical-leadership-review-literature
- 52. Grigoropoulos JE, Gialamas S. Educators Leaders: Inspiring Learners to Transform Society by Becoming Architects of their Own Learning. Int J Progress Educ. 2018 Oct 17;14(5):33-8. Available from: http://ijpe. penpublishing.net/makale/595
- 53. Quency GT, Cristine GM, Nariss GT, Dennis MB. Challenges of Non-Values Education Teachers in Teaching Secondary Values Education. Int J Soc Sci Hum Res. 2024 Jun 5;7(06). Available from: https://ijsshr.in/v7i6/9.
- 54. Blanchet-Cohen N, Reilly RC. Teachers' perspectives on environmental education in multicultural contexts: Towards culturally-responsive environmental education. Teach Teach Educ. 2013 Nov;36:12-22. Available from: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0742051X13001054
- 55. Ciata RD, Doblon IM, Torreros M. "Navigating Challenges: A Study on the Impact of Non-Specialized Teachers in Edukasyon Sa Pagpapakatao (Values Education) in Samar Division." Int J Soc Sci Hum Res. 2024 Jun 8;7(06). Available from: https://ijsshr.in/v7i6/28.php
- 56. Faradis NS, Lugman Y. The Utilization Of Instagram As A Promotional Media In Marketing Communication Strategy In The Culinary Industry During The Covid-19 Pandemic (@kulinertegal Instagram Account Case Study). JHSS (Journal Humanit Soc Stud. 2022 Nov 29;6(3):291-5. Available from: https://journal.unpak.ac.id/index. php/jhss/article/view/6385
- 57. Hu R, Mou S. Outdoor Education for Sustainable Development: A Systematic Literature Review. Sustainability. 2025 Apr 9;17(8):3338. Available from: https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/17/8/3338
- 58. Tan M, Pedretti E. Negotiating the Complexities of Environmental Education: A Study of Ontario Teachers. Can J Sci Math Technol Educ. 2010 Feb 18;10(1):61-78. Available from: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/ abs/10.1080/14926150903574320
- 59. Qudrat-Ullah H. Enhancing Biodiversity Education and Outreach for Conservation Awareness and Environmental Stewardship. Adv Environ Eng Res. 2025 Apr 2;06(02):1-7. Available from: https://www.lidsen. com/journals/aeer/aeer-06-02-016
- 60. Bashir FM, Bornoma AH, Idris HA. The Influence of Secondary Schoolteachers on Educational Sustainability in Mubi Nigeria. J Public Value Adm Insights. 2019 Jul 30;2(2):11-4. Available from: http://readersinsight.net/ index.php/JPVAI/article/view/910

FINANCING

All funding for this research is fully funded by Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat Universitas Negeri Padang, with contract number: 1506/UN35.15/LT/2025.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

This research has no potential conflict of interest.

AUTHORSHIP CONTRIBUTION

Conceptualization: Eko Purnomo, Amung Ma'mun, Mashuri Eko Winarno.

Data curation: Nina Jermaina. Formal analysis: Amung Ma'mun.

Research: Eko Purnomo.

Methodology: Eko Purnomo, Amung Ma'mun.

Project management: Eko Purnomo.

Resources: Nina jermaina. Software: Nina Jermaina.

Supervision: Amung Ma'mun, Mashuri Eko Winarno. Validation: Amung Ma'mun, Mashuri Eko Winarno.

Display: Eko Purnomo, Nina Jermaina.

Drafting - original draft: Eko Purnomo.

Writing - proofreading and editing: Eko Purnomo, Nina Jermaina.